

MINUTES

**Meeting: London Assembly
(Mayor's Question Time)**
Date: Monday 22 February 2016
Time: 9.00 am
**Place: Chamber, City Hall, The Queen's
Walk, London, SE1 2AA**

Copies of the minutes may be found at: <http://www.london.gov.uk/mayor-assembly/london-assembly/whole-assembly>

Present:

Jennette Arnold OBE AM (Chair)	Darren Johnson AM
Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chairman)	Jenny Jones AM
Gareth Bacon AM	Stephen Knight AM
Mayor John Biggs AM	Kit Malthouse AM MP
Kemi Badenoch AM	Joanne McCartney AM
Andrew Boff AM	Steve O'Connell AM
James Cleverly AM MP	Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM
Tom Copley AM	Murad Qureshi AM
Andrew Dismore AM	Dr Onkar Sahota AM
Len Duvall AM	Navin Shah AM
Roger Evans AM	Richard Tracey AM
Nicky Gavron AM	Fiona Twycross AM

1 Apologies for Absence and Chair's Announcements (Item 1)

- 1.1 Apologies for absence were received on behalf of Valerie Shawcross CBE AM.
- 1.2 The Chair welcomed to the public gallery guests from the Oregon Students Abroad Programme and the Richmond Park Forum.

2 Declarations of Interests (Item 2)

- 2.1 The Assembly received the report of the Executive Director of Secretariat.

2.2 Resolved:

(a) That the list of offices held by Assembly Members, as set out in the table at Agenda Item 2, be noted as disclosable pecuniary interests; and

(b) That Roger Evans AM's declaration of a non-pecuniary interest, arising from his appointment as a member of the European Committee of the Regions, be additionally noted, insofar as it related to the business set out on the agenda for the meeting.

3 Minutes (Item 3)

3.1 Resolved:

That the minutes from the London Assembly (Plenary) meeting held on 27 January 2016 be signed by the Chair as a correct record.

4 Final Draft Consolidated Budget 2016/17 (Item 4)

Report of the Mayor (Item 4a)

- 4.1 The Assembly received the Mayor's Final Draft Consolidated Budget 2016/17 for the GLA Group.
- 4.2 The Chair also explained that, in accordance with section 100(B)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, she had agreed to admit to the agenda as urgent business some correspondence between the Clerk to the London Fire and Emergency Planning Authority (LFEPA) and the Mayor's Chief of Staff in relation to LFEPA's component budget for 2016/17. This correspondence had been circulated and published under cover of a supplementary agenda for

**Greater London Authority
London Assembly (Mayor's Question Time)
Monday 22 February 2016**

the meeting. The Chair had agreed to admit this correspondence on the basis that the letters had not been issued until after the publication of the main agenda for the meeting and by way of background information to the Assembly's consideration of the Final Draft Consolidated Budget 2016/17.

4.3 Resolved:

That the letter from the Clerk of the London Fire and Emergency Planning Authority to the Mayor's Chief of Staff dated 17 February 2016 and the response from the Chief of Staff dated 18 February 2016 be noted.

- 4.4 The Assembly then received an oral statement from the Mayor on the Budget. A transcript of the Mayor's oral statement is attached as **Appendix 1**.
- 4.5 Sir Edward Lister, Chief of Staff and Deputy Mayor for Policy and Planning, and Martin Clarke, Executive Director of Resources, were also in attendance for the statement and for the duration of the question and answer session.

Questions to the Mayor (Item 4b)

- 4.6 Assembly Members put questions to the Mayor on his Final Draft Consolidated Budget. The transcript of the questions put by Members and the Mayor's answers is attached as **Appendix 2**.

Consideration by the Assembly of the Mayor of London's Final Draft Consolidated Budget Proposals 2016/17 (Item 4c)

- 4.7 Following the Mayor's departure, the Assembly debated the Mayor's Final Draft Consolidated Budget 2016/17.
- 4.8 The substantive motion before the Assembly was: "To approve the Final Draft Consolidated Budget for 2016/17 with or without amendment."
- 4.9 A Formal Budget Amendment, presented on behalf of the London Assembly's GLA Conservatives Group, was moved by Gareth Bacon AM and seconded by Kemi Badenoch AM (and is attached as **Appendix 3**).
- 4.10 A Formal Budget Amendment, presented on behalf of the London Assembly's Liberal Democrat Group, was moved by Stephen Knight AM and seconded by Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM (and is attached as **Appendix 4**).
- 4.11 A Formal Budget Amendment, presented on behalf of the London Assembly's Green Party Group, was moved by Darren Johnson AM and seconded by Jenny Jones AM (and is attached as **Appendix 5**).

**Greater London Authority
London Assembly (Mayor's Question Time)
Monday 22 February 2016**

- 4.12 In accordance with Standing Order 6.6E(1), a named vote was taken on each Budget Amendment, in the order in which they were moved.
- 4.13 The votes in relation to the Budget Amendment in the name of Gareth Bacon AM were cast as follows:
- For the Amendment: Gareth Bacon AM, Kemi Badenoch AM, Andrew Boff AM, James Cleverly AM MP, Roger Evans AM, Kit Malthouse AM MP, Steve O'Connell AM, Richard Tracey AM and Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chairman).
- Against the Amendment: Mayor John Biggs AM, Tom Copley AM, Andrew Dismore AM, Len Duvall AM, Nicky Gavron AM, Darren Johnson AM, Jenny Jones AM, Stephen Knight AM, Joanne McCartney AM, Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM, Murad Qureshi AM, Dr Onkar Sahota AM, Navin Shah AM, Fiona Twycross AM and Jennette Arnold OBE AM (Chair).
- 4.14 With 9 votes being cast in favour and 15 votes being cast against, the Budget Amendment did not receive the requisite two-thirds majority to amend the Mayor's budget proposals.
- 4.15 The votes in relation to the Budget Amendment in the name of Stephen Knight AM were cast as follows:
- For the Amendment: Stephen Knight AM and Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM.
- Against the Amendment: Gareth Bacon AM, Kemi Badenoch AM, Mayor John Biggs AM, Andrew Boff AM, James Cleverly AM MP, Tom Copley AM, Andrew Dismore AM, Len Duvall AM, Roger Evans AM, Nicky Gavron AM, Darren Johnson AM, Jenny Jones AM, Kit Malthouse AM MP, Joanne McCartney AM, Steve O'Connell AM, Murad Qureshi AM, Dr Onkar Sahota AM, Navin Shah AM, Richard Tracey AM, Fiona Twycross AM, Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chairman) and Jennette Arnold OBE AM (Chair).
- 4.16 With 2 votes being cast in favour and 22 votes being cast against, the Budget Amendment did not receive the requisite two-thirds majority to amend the Mayor's budget proposals.
- 4.17 The votes in relation to the Budget Amendment in the name of Darren Johnson AM were cast as follows:
- For the Amendment: Darren Johnson AM and Jenny Jones AM.
- Against the Amendment: Gareth Bacon AM, Kemi Badenoch AM, Mayor John Biggs AM, Andrew Boff AM, James Cleverly AM MP, Tom Copley AM, Andrew Dismore AM, Len Duvall AM, Roger Evans AM, Nicky Gavron AM, Stephen Knight AM, Kit Malthouse AM MP, Joanne McCartney AM, Steve O'Connell AM, Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM, Murad Qureshi AM, Dr

**Greater London Authority
London Assembly (Mayor's Question Time)
Monday 22 February 2016**

Onkar Sahota AM, Navin Shah AM, Richard Tracey AM, Fiona Twycross AM, Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chairman) and Jennette Arnold OBE AM (Chair).

- 4.18 With 2 votes being cast in favour and 22 votes being cast against, the Budget Amendment did not receive the requisite two-thirds majority to amend the Mayor's budget proposals.
- 4.19 Stephen Knight AM moved and Caroline Pidgeon AM seconded a Budget Related Motion (attached as **Appendix 6**).
- 4.20 Upon being put to the vote, the motion was lost (4 votes cast in favour and 20 votes cast against).
- 4.21 Len Duvall AM moved and Dr Onkar Sahota AM seconded a Budget Related Motion (attached as **Appendix 7**).
- 4.22 Upon being put to the vote, the motion was lost (11 votes cast in favour and 13 votes cast against).
- 4.23 The Chair then formally put the substantive motion, namely,

"To approve the Final Draft Consolidated Budget 2016/17 without amendment"
- 4.24 At the request of Gareth Bacon AM and in accordance with Standing Order 2.7, a named vote was taken and the votes were cast as follows:
- For the motion: Gareth Bacon AM, Kemi Badenoch AM, Andrew Boff AM, James Cleverly AM MP, Roger Evans AM, Kit Malthouse AM MP, Steve O'Connell AM, Richard Tracey AM and Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chairman).
- Against the Amendment: Mayor John Biggs AM, Tom Copley AM, Andrew Dismore AM, Len Duvall AM, Nicky Gavron AM, Darren Johnson AM, Jenny Jones AM, Stephen Knight AM, Joanne McCartney AM, Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM, Murad Qureshi AM, Dr Onkar Sahota AM, Navin Shah AM, Fiona Twycross AM and Jennette Arnold OBE AM (Chair).
- 4.25 With 9 votes being cast in favour and 15 votes being cast against, the motion was lost. The Chair explained that, although the substantive motion had not been agreed, as no amendments to the Budget had been agreed by the requisite majority, and in accordance with Paragraph 8(5) of Schedule 6 to the GLA Act 1999 (as amended), the Assembly was deemed to have approved, without amendment, the Final Draft Consolidated Budget for 2016/17.
- 4.26 The Chair confirmed that that concluded the Assembly's consideration of the Final Draft Consolidated Budget for 2016/17.

**Greater London Authority
London Assembly (Mayor's Question Time)
Monday 22 February 2016**

- 4.27 During the course of the discussion on this Agenda Item and in response to a query raised, the Chair confirmed that the Chair and officers would use the mode of address/title for each Member in line with individual Member's requests in this regard.

5 Mayor's Report (Item 5)

5.1 Resolved:

That the Mayor's report covering the period from 7 January to 8 February 2016 be noted.

6 Questions to the Mayor (Item 6)

6.1 Resolved:

That it be noted that written answers to all questions submitted to this meeting under the Mayor's Question Time procedure will be provided on 25 February 2016.

7 Date of Next Meeting (Item 7)

- 7.1 It was noted that the next scheduled meeting of the London Assembly would be the Plenary meeting which would take place at 10.00am on Wednesday 2 March 2016 in the Chamber, City Hall.

8 Any Other Business the Chair Considers Urgent (Item 8)

Urgent Motion (Item 8b)

- 8.1 The Chair explained that, in accordance with section 100(B)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, she had agreed to admit to the agenda as an item of urgent business a motion in the name of Len Duvall AM, in order that the matter could be dealt with at the earliest opportunity. The wording of the motion had been circulated under cover of a supplementary agenda for the meeting.
- 8.2 In accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 3.12, Len Duvall AM, as proposer of the motion, was permitted one minute to explain to the Assembly why it should agree to consider the motion.
- 8.3 Upon a vote without debate, the Assembly agreed to treat the motion as urgent and consider it (14 votes cast in favour and 10 votes cast against).
- 8.4 In response to a point of order raised, the Chair confirmed that it was not procedurally improper for the Assembly to express a view in relation to membership of the European Union

**Greater London Authority
London Assembly (Mayor's Question Time)
Monday 22 February 2016**

prior to the June 2016 referendum on this matter and nor would this prohibit the Assembly, following the May 2016 GLA elections, in expressing additional or alternative views.

8.5 Len Duvall AM moved, and Stephen Knight AM seconded, the following motion:

“This Assembly notes the reforms negotiated by the Prime Minister as part of his drive for Britain to remain in a reformed European Union. This Assembly welcomes the Prime Minister’s decision to campaign to remain in the EU. We believe that both London and the UK are better off in the EU.

The Assembly notes the following benefits to London of EU membership:

Economic Prosperity: In 2014 London exported £12.3 billion of goods to the EU (nearly 43% of all London’s exports of goods) in the same year we imported £27.6 billion of products from the EU (40.4% of all the capitals imported goods).ⁱ Meanwhile analysis conducted by the Centre for Economics and Business Research (CEBR) for London First says that EU membership could add £13.9bn to London’s Economy by 2030 providing a “permanent boost” to the capital’s economy.ⁱⁱ

London and the EU are economically intertwined. Putting up a barrier between us and the world’s biggest free market would be financially devastating.

Jobs and Employment: 542,000 jobs in London were associated with the EU in 2011.ⁱⁱⁱ Whilst these jobs would not be guaranteed to go post-Brexit, they would be far less secure if our major trading partner was less favourably accessible. HSBC alone have warned that around 1,000 jobs would move over the Channel if Britain were to exit the EU.^{iv} We must also recognise the improved rights and protections that EU membership has given British workers, from maternity and paternity leave to paid holidays, protections for agency workers and laws against discrimination.

Environment: Tackling and adapting to climate change is one of the most serious challenges facing London this century. It’s only through working with our European partners that we can ever hope to bring down carbon emissions and create a more sustainable way of living. European directives have driven progress in tackling some of London’s biggest environmental challenge from toxic air, to waste and recycling and combating climate change.

Safety and Security: The Home Secretary, Theresa May, has stated that the European Union is vital in the fight against international terrorism and that “jihadists threatening Britain cannot be defeated by acting in isolation”^v

Britain’s membership means working in partnership with other EU nations, gathering and sharing intelligence that assists with identifying and preventing terrorist threats. Andrew Park (head of MI5) stated that MI5 and its international partners had thwarted 6 terrorist threats in the UK and several plots overseas. Without this international collaboration and partnership Britain leaves itself vulnerable at a time of significant threats to its safety.^{vi}

Our membership of the European Arrest Warrant gives Britain an extra layer of security for our citizens. The loss of the EAW would be a significant blow to the scope and capability of the Criminal Justice System.

While this Assembly believes that the EU needs reform and improvement, a blanket exit isn't the answer for London or for Britain. In terms of security, environment, finance and economy we are inextricably intertwined with our neighbours. To get the best deal for London we need to be at the table."

- 8.6 Following debate and upon being put to the vote, the motion in the name of Len Duvall AM, namely:

"This Assembly notes the reforms negotiated by the Prime Minister as part of his drive for Britain to remain in a reformed European Union. This Assembly welcomes the Prime Minister's decision to campaign to remain in the EU. We believe that both London and the UK are better off in the EU.

The Assembly notes the following benefits to London of EU membership:

Economic Prosperity: In 2014 London exported £12.3 billion of goods to the EU (nearly 43% of all London's exports of goods) in the same year we imported £27.6 billion of products from the EU (40.4% of all the capitals imported goods).^{vii} Meanwhile analysis conducted by the Centre for Economics and Business Research (CEBR) for London First says that EU membership could add £13.9bn to London's Economy by 2030 providing a "permanent boost" to the capital's economy.^{viii} London and the EU are economically intertwined. Putting up a barrier between us and the world's biggest free market would be financially devastating.

Jobs and Employment: 542,000 jobs in London were associated with the EU in 2011.^{ix} Whilst these jobs would not be guaranteed to go post-Brexit, they would be far less secure if our major trading partner was less favourably accessible. HSBC alone have warned that around 1,000 jobs would move over the Channel if Britain were to exit the EU. ^x We must also recognise the improved rights and protections that EU membership has given British workers, from maternity and paternity leave to paid holidays, protections for agency workers and laws against discrimination.

Environment: Tackling and adapting to climate change is one of the most serious challenges facing London this century. It's only through working with our European partners that we can ever hope to bring down carbon emissions and create a more sustainable way of living. European directives have driven progress in tackling some of London's biggest environmental challenge from toxic air, to waste and recycling and combating climate change.

Safety and Security: The Home Secretary, Theresa May, has stated that the European Union is vital in the fight against international terrorism and that "jihadists threatening Britain cannot be defeated by acting in isolation"^{xi}

Britain's membership means working in partnership with other EU nations, gathering and sharing intelligence that assists with identifying and preventing terrorist threats. Andrew Park (head of MI5) stated that MI5 and its international partners had thwarted 6 terrorist threats in the UK and several plots overseas. Without this international collaboration and partnership Britain leaves itself vulnerable at a time of significant threats to its safety.^{xii}

Our membership of the European Arrest Warrant gives Britain an extra layer of security for our citizens. The loss of the EAW would be a significant blow to the scope and capability of the Criminal Justice System.

While this Assembly believes that the EU needs reform and improvement, a blanket exit isn't the answer for London or for Britain. In terms of security, environment, finance and economy we are inextricably intertwined with our neighbours. To get the best deal for London we need to be at the table."

was agreed (14 votes cast in favour and 7 votes cast against).

9 Close of Meeting

9.1 The meeting closed at 12.24pm.

<hr/>	
Chair	Date
Contact Officer:	Rebecca Arnold Committee Services Manager GLA Secretariat, City Hall The Queen's Walk, London, SE1 2AA
Telephone:	020 7983 4421
Email:	rebecca.arnold@london.gov.uk

**Greater London Authority
London Assembly (Mayor's Question Time)
Monday 22 February 2016**

ⁱ *UK jobs supported by exports to the EU Cebr analysis of UK jobs associated with demand from the European Union*, March 2014

ⁱⁱ *EU referendum: Pro-European Union group says Brexit would cost London £13.9bn*, CityAM, 8 February 2016

ⁱⁱⁱ *UK jobs supported by exports to the EU Cebr analysis of UK jobs associated with demand from the European Union*, March 2014

^{iv} *HSBC could switch 1,000 banking jobs to France after a Brexit vote*, The Guardian, 15th February 2016

^v *Theresa May indicates EU is vital for fight against terrorism as she warns against 'isolation'*, The Telegraph, 16th Feb 2016

^{vi} *Terror threat to UK is greater than any point in career, says MI5 chief*, The Guardian, 29th October 2015